



CONFIDENTIAL
NIHR HTA Commissioning Board
Minutes of the Forty-fourth Meeting

Date	Wednesday 5 th January 2011
Place	Danubius Hotel, London
Present Members	Professor Hywel Williams (Chair) Professor Andrew Farmer (Deputy Chair) Professor Tom Walley (Programme Director) Professor Ann Ashburn Professor Deborah Ashby Professor Peter Croft Professor Jenny Donovan Professor John W Gregory Professor Steven Halligan Professor Allan House Dr Martin Landray Professor Stephen Morris Professor Andrea Nelson Professor John Norrie Dr Rafael Perera Professor Martin Underwood Dr Duncan Young Professor Marion Walker Professor Freddie Hamdy Professor Jonathan Green Professor Peter Brocklehurst
NETSCC, HTA Secretariat	Dr Andrew Cook (Consultant Advisor) Dr Nick Hicks (Consultant Advisor) Mrs Stephanie Russell (Senior Programme Manager) Mr Mark Townsend (Programme Manager) Ms Helen Day (Assistant Programme Manager) Mrs Gillian Davage (Administrator)
Apologies	Professor John Cairns, Professor Barney Reeves
Observers	Jon Deeks, Professor of Health Statistics, University of Birmingham (Deputy Chair Designate) Syd Anstee, Researcher, HTA Interventional Procedures Panel (pm only)

	<u>Primary Research – Full proposals</u>
--	---

09/161 Long-term outcomes of NHS stop smoking services (1 proposal)

Professor Farmer chaired. Dr. Rafael Perera, Dr Martin Landray and Professor John Norrie presented the proposal.

The board discussed one proposal and the outcome was:

Bauld (09/161/01) will be recommended for funding

09/162 Promoting sustained increase in physical activity to prevent type 2 diabetes (3 proposals)

Professor Farmer chaired. Professors Brocklehurst, Ashburn and Ashby presented the three proposals.

The board discussed three proposals and the outcome was:

Gill (09/162/01) was rejected

Khunti (09/162/02) will be recommended for funding with changes.

Cooper (09162/05) was rejected.

09/163 The diagnosis of meniscus tears (2 proposals)

Professor Williams chaired. Professors Halligan, Professor Ashburn and Dr. Landray presented the two proposals.

The board discussed two proposals and the outcome was:

Maffuli (09/163/01) was rejected.

Blyth (09/163/02) would be recommended for funding with changes, to be actioned by the chair.

09/164 - Interventions to promote the uptake of cervical screening (2 proposals)

Professor Williams chaired. Professors Norrie, Halligan and House presented the two applications.

The board discussed two proposals and the outcome was:

Kitchener (09/164/01) was recommended for fund with changes.

Moss (09/164/04) was rejected.

09/169 - Social stories to reduce challenging behaviour for school aged children with autism spectrum disorders (3 proposals)

Professor Williams chaired. Professors Halligan and Donovan presented the three proposals. Professor Williams presented Professor Reeves' comments.

The board discussed three proposals and the outcome was:

Hastings (09/169/01) was rejected.

McConachie (09/169/05) was rejected

Wright (09/169/07) recommended for funding with changes.

09/166 - Management of Otitis Media in children with Down's syndrome (1 proposal)

Professor Farmer chaired. Professors Ashby, Morris, Cairns (not present) and Norrie presented the three proposals.

The board discussed one proposal and the outcome was:

Fortnum (09/166/01) was approved for funding with changes

09/167 - Management of Otitis Media in children with cleft palate (1 proposal)

Professor Farmer chaired. Professors Croft, Ashby and Morris presented the proposal.

The board discussed one proposal and the outcome was:

O'Brien (09/167/02) was recommended for fund with changes.

Direct Research Projects (DRPs)

10/82 - A Study of Donor Ex-vivo Lung Perfusion in UK Lung Transplantation (DEVELOP-UK) (1 proposal)

Professor Williams chaired. Dr Duncan Young, and Professors Reeves and Halligan presented the proposal.

The board discussed one proposal and the outcome was:

Fisher (10/82) was recommended for fund with changes.

Primary Research Outlines

10/61 Reducing alcohol consumption in pregnant women (5 proposals)

Professor Williams chaired. Professors House, Reeves and Underwood presented the proposals

10/61/02 was withdrawn by applicants before the board meeting

The board discussed 4 proposals and the outcome was:

Gray (10/61/01) was rejected.
Swanson (10/61/03) was rejected.
Armitage (10/61/04) was rejected.
Aiton (10/61/05) was rejected.

The board did not fund any of the proposals in this topic area, but agreed that the prioritisation panels should revisit the topic once the RfPB study has published.

10/62 Interventions to support changes in diet and physical activity in people with high cardiovascular risk (4 proposals)

The board discussed 4 proposals and the outcome was:

Breckon (10/62/01) was shortlisted.
Papageorgiou (10/62/02) was rejected.
Ismail (10/62/03) was shortlisted.
Gray (10/62/04) was rejected.

10/63 The diagnostic accuracy of hearing tests and cost-effectiveness of school entry hearing screening programmes(4 proposals)

****10/63 This topic was previously returned to PSG by the commissioning board and had been reprioritised (previous topic area no 09/113)****

The board discussed 4 proposals and the outcome was:

Ray (10/63/01) was rejected.
Thyer (10/63/02) was shortlisted.
Fortnum (10/63/03) was shortlisted.
Davis (10/63/04) was rejected.

10/64 Automated reading of retinal photography in diabetic eye screening (2 proposals)

Professor Farmer chaired. Professors Gregory and Hamdy introduced two proposals.

The board discussed 2 proposals and the outcome was:

Nussey (10/64/01) was rejected.

Butcher (10/64/02) was rejected.

The HTA programme was unable to commission in this area.

The applicants should be advised that this topic will be re-advertised.

The brief should be specific about the experimental paradigm.

10/65 A diagnostic accuracy study of the spot urinary protein: creatinine ratio with a modelled evaluation of its diagnostic utility in the assessment of pre-eclampsia (2 proposals)

Professor Williams chaired. Professors Halligan, Morris and Walker presented two proposals.

The board discussed 2 proposals and the outcome was:

Kilby (10/65/01) was shortlisted.

Waugh (10/65/02) was shortlisted.

10/66 Screening intervals for diabetic retinopathy (4 proposals)

Professor Williams chaired. Professors Nelson, House and Walker presented four proposals.

The board discussed 4 proposals and the outcome was:

Scanlon (10/66/01) was shortlisted.

Azuara-Blanco (10/66/02) was shortlisted.

Butcher (10/66/03) was rejected.

Bain (10/66/04) was rejected.

10/68 Early whole-body magnetic resonance imaging in the staging of cancer (8 proposals)

Professor Williams chaired. Professors Croft, Gregory and Donovan presented 8 proposals.

The board discussed 8 proposals and the outcome was:

Taylor (10/68/01) was shortlisted.

Cox (10/68/02) was rejected.

Turnbull (10/68/03) was rejected.

Qureshi (10/68/04) was shortlisted.

Koh (10/68/05) was rejected.

Gleeson (10/68/06) was rejected.

Gleeson (10/68/07) was rejected.

Dunlop (10/68/08) was shortlisted.

10/69 Acupuncture for back pain in pregnancy (5 proposals)

Professor Williams chaired. Professor Morris, Dr. Young and Professor Ashburn presented 5 proposals.

The board discussed 5 proposals and the outcome was:

McPherson (10/69/01) was rejected.

Jolly (10/69/02) was rejected.

Underwood (10/69/03) was shortlisted.

Lokugamage (10/69/04) was rejected.

Foster (10/69/05) was shortlisted.

10/71 Use of sodium bicarbonate in elderly patients with low grade acidosis and chronic renal disease (3 proposals)

Professor Williams chaired. Dr Landray, Professor Nelson and Dr Young presented three proposals.

The board discussed 3 proposals and the outcome was:

Witham (10/71/01) was shortlisted.

Yaqoob (10/71/02) was shortlisted.

Mabhala (10/71/03) was rejected.

Close of meeting