



CONFIDENTIAL
NIHR HTA Commissioning Board

HTACB/300

Minutes of the Forty-sixth Meeting

Date	Tuesday & Wednesday, 5th and 6th July 2011
Place	Danubius Hotel, London
Present Members	Professor Hywel Williams (Chair) Professor Jon Deeks (Deputy Chair) Professor Ann Ashburn Professor Jenny Donovan Professor John W Gregory Professor Steven Halligan Professor Allan House Dr Martin Landray Professor Stephen Morris Professor Andrea Nelson Professor John Norrie Dr Rafael Perera Professor Martin Underwood Dr Duncan Young Professor Freddie Hamdy Professor Peter Brocklehurst Professor Barney Reeves Professor Marion Walker (Day 2 only) Professor Irwin Nazareth
NETSCC, HTA Secretariat	Dr Andrew Cook (Consultant Advisor) Dr Nick Hicks (Consultant Advisor) (Day 1 only) Mrs Pauline Swinburne (Senior Programme Manager) Dr Sarah Thomas (Senior Programme Manager) Mr Mark Townsend (Programme Manager) Miss Daniela Doncakova (Assistant Programme Manager) Mrs Gillian Davage (Administrator)
Apologies	Professor Tom Walley Professor Jonathan Green Professor Marion Walker (Day 1 only)
Observers	Ms Clare O'Loughlen - Network Liaison Senior Programme Manager NETSCC, (Day 1 only) Mrs Alison Ford - Public and Patient Involvement Manager NETSCC- External Relations (Day 2 only)

6.	<u>Primary Research – Full proposals</u>
6.1	<i>09/127/43 - A 'cohort randomised controlled trial' of the clinical and cost effectiveness of the offer of two multi component behavioural intervention programmes for overweight and obese adults (Pounds for Pounds) (1 proposal)</i>
	<p>Professor Williams chaired.</p> <p>Professors Norrie, Brocklehurst and Gregory presented the proposal.</p> <p>The board discussed one proposal and the outcome was:</p> <p>Relton (09/127/43) - was rejected</p>
6.2	<i>09/165 - Self-Management education for adults with poorly controlled eplLEpsy (SMILE) A Randomised Controlled Trial (1 proposal)</i>
	<p>Professor Williams chaired.</p> <p>Professors Morris, House and Donovan presented the proposal.</p> <p>The board discussed one proposal and the outcome was:</p> <p>Ridsdale (09/165/01) - was invited for resubmission</p>
6.3	<i>10/62 - Interventions to support changes in diet and physical activity in people with high cardiovascular risk. (2 proposals)</i>
	<p>Professor Williams chaired.</p> <p>Professors Brocklehurst, Norrie and Hamdy presented the proposal.</p> <p>The board discussed two proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <p>Breckon (10/62/01) - was rejected</p> <p>Ismail (10/62/03) - was recommended for funding with changes.</p>
6.4	<i>10/63 - The diagnostic accuracy of hearing tests and cost-effectiveness of school entry hearing screening programmes (2 proposals)</i>
	<p>Professor Donovan chaired.</p> <p>Professors Underwood and Brocklehurst and Dr Perera presented two proposals.</p>

	<p>The board discussed two proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <p>Thyer (10/63/02) - was rejected</p> <p>Fortnum (10/63/03) - was recommended for funding with changes</p>
6.5	<p><i>10/65 – A diagnostic accuracy study of the spot urinary protein: creatinine ratio with a modelled evaluation of its diagnostic utility in the assessment of pre-eclampsia (2 proposals)</i></p>
	<p>Professor Williams chaired.</p> <p>Professors Halligan, Morris and Walker presented the proposal.</p> <p>The board discussed two proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <p>Kilby (10/65/01) - was rejected</p> <p>Waugh (10/65/02) - was recommended for funding with changes.</p>
6.6	<p><i>10/71 – Use of sodium bicarbonate in elderly patients with low grade acidosis and chronic renal disease (2 proposals)</i></p>
	<p>Professor Williams chaired.</p> <p>Dr Landray, Professor Nelson, Dr Young and Professor Ashburn presented the two proposals.</p> <p>The board discussed two proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <p>Witham (10/71/01) - was recommended for funding with changes</p> <p>Yaqoob (10/71/02) - was rejected</p>
6.7	<p><i>10/66 –Screening intervals for diabetic retinopathy (2 proposals)</i></p>
	<p>Professor Williams chaired.</p> <p>Professors Nelson, House and Walker presented the proposal.</p> <p>The board discussed two proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <p>Scanlon (10/66/01) - was recommended for funding with changes</p> <p>Azuarro-Blanco (10/66/02) - was rejected</p>
6.8	<p><i>10/68 – Early whole-body magnetic resonance imaging in the staging of</i></p>

	<i>cancer (3 proposals)</i>
	<p>Professor Deeks chaired.</p> <p>Professors Gregory, Donovan and Underwood presented the proposals.</p> <p>The board discussed three proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <p>Taylor (10/68/01) - was recommended for funding with changes.</p> <p>Qureshi (10/68/04) - was rejected</p> <p>Dunlop (10/68/08) – was rejected</p>
6.9	<i>10/69 – Acupuncture for back pain in pregnancy (2 proposals)</i>
	<p>Professor Deeks chaired.</p> <p>Professor Morris, Dr Young and Professor Halligan presented the proposals</p> <p>The board discussed two proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <p>Underwood (10/69/03) – was rejected</p> <p>Foster (10/69/05) - was recommended for straight funding</p>
7	<u>Evidence synthesis – full proposals</u>
7.1	<i>10/133 - The cost effectiveness of testing strategies for type 2 diabetes (1 proposal)</i>
	<p>Professor Williams chaired.</p> <p>Professors Gregory, Morris and Nelson presented the proposal.</p> <p>The board discussed the proposal and the outcome was:</p> <p>Gillett (10/133/01) - was recommended for funding with changes.</p>
7.2	<i>10/136 - Ablative therapy for men with localised prostate cancer (3 proposals)</i>
	<p>Professor Williams chaired.</p> <p>Professors Walker, Nelson and Underwood presented the two proposals</p>

	<p>The board discussed the proposal and the outcome was:</p> <p>Ramsay (10/136/01) - was recommended for straight funding.</p>
7.3	<p><i>10/141 - Interventions to improve therapeutic communication for black and minority ethnic (BME) patients needing mental health services (2 proposals)</i></p>
	<p>Professor Williams chaired.</p> <p>Professors House, Reeves and Ashburn presented three proposals.</p> <p>The board discussed two proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <p>Dundar (10/141/01) – was rejected</p> <p>Bhui (10/141/02) – was recommended for straight funding.</p>
7.4	<p><i>10/140 - Non pharmacological interventions for Attention Deficit / Hyperactivity Disorder (ADHD) in school settings (2 proposals)</i></p>
	<p>Professor Deeks chaired</p> <p>Professors Reeves, Green and Dr Perera presented the proposals</p> <p>The board discussed two proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <p>Sayal (10/140/01) – was rejected</p> <p>Ford (10/140/02) – was recommended for funding with changes.</p>
7.5	<p><i>10/142 - Treatment for tics in children with Tourette’s syndrome (2 proposals)</i></p>
	<p>Professor Deeks Chaired</p> <p>Drs Perera, Landray and Professor Norrie</p> <p>Hollis (10/142/01) – was recommended for funding with changes, pending further exploration of potential overlap.</p> <p>Post-meeting note: NETSCC, HTA are seeking peer review of the potential overlap for this proposal and the decision will be delayed.</p> <p>Following a second review period the decision for a fund with changes was upheld</p>

	McDaid (10/142/02) – was rejected.
8	<u>Primary research outlines</u>
8.1	<i>10/93 - Sexual Health Behaviour Change Interventions by Text Messaging (3 proposals)</i>
	<p>Professor Williams chaired.</p> <p>Dr Landray, Professor Gregory and Dr Young presented three proposals.</p> <p>The board discussed three proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <p>10/93/02 – Wyatt was rejected. 10/93/03 – McLeod was shortlisted 10/93/04 – Free was shortlisted</p>
8.2	<i>10/131 - Condom use training (2 proposals)</i>
	<p>Professor Williams chaired.</p> <p>Professor Underwood, Dr Landray and Professor Nelson presented two proposals.</p> <p>The board discussed two proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <p>10/131/01 – Bailey was shortlisted 10/131/02 – Flowers was shortlisted</p>
8.3	<i>10/134 - Clinical and cost effectiveness of using non-invasive ventilation to wean patients off invasive ventilation (6 proposals)</i>
	<p>Professor Williams chaired</p> <p>Professors Norrie, Walker and Donovan presented the proposals</p> <p>The board discussed six proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <p>10/134/01 MacRae was rejected 10/134/02 Mills was shortlisted 10/134/03 Mackenzie was rejected 10/134/04 Hampshire was rejected 10/134/05 Rowan was shortlisted 10/134/06 Perkins was shortlisted</p>

8.4	<i>10/135 - Speech therapy for patients with Parkinson's disease (3 proposals)</i>
	<p>Professor Williams chaired</p> <p>Professors Donovan, Hamdy and Dr Perera presented three proposals</p> <p>The board discussed three proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <p>10/135/01 Enderby was rejected 10/135/02 Sackley was shortlisted 10/135/03 Lowitt was rejected</p>
8.5	<i>10/137 Extra-corporeal shockwave lithotripsy for ureteric stones (1 proposal)</i>
	<p>Professor Deeks chaired</p> <p>Professors Reeves, Hamdy and Halligan presented the proposal.</p> <p>The board discussed the proposals and the outcome was:</p> <p>10/137/01 – McClinton was shortlisted</p>
8.6	<i>10/139 - Interventions for psychosexual dysfunction after treatment for gynaecological malignancy (1 proposal)</i>
	<p>Professor Deeks chaired</p> <p>Professors Brocklehurst, Norrie and House presented one proposal</p> <p>The board discussed the proposal and the outcome was:</p> <p>10/139/01 Roberts was rejected</p>
8.7	<i>10/143 - Increased doses of inhaled steroid treatment in adult asthma patients (1 proposal)</i>
	<p>Professor Deeks chaired</p> <p>Professors Halligan, Ashburn and Dr Young presented the proposal</p> <p>The board discussed the proposal and the outcome was:</p> <p>10/143/01 Harrison was shortlisted</p>

8.8	<i>10/145 - Duration of treatment of venous thromboembolism in malignant disease. (3 proposals)</i>
	<p>Professor Williams chaired</p> <p>Professors Ashburn, Halligan and Reeves presented the proposals</p> <p>The board discussed three proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <p>10/145/01 Noble was shortlisted</p> <p>10/145/02 Hasan was rejected</p> <p>10/145/03 Young was shortlisted</p>
8.9	<i>10/146 - Duration of intravenous antibiotic therapy for children with acute osteomyelitis or septic arthritis (1 proposal)</i>
	<p>Professor Williams Chaired</p> <p>Dr Perera, Professors Green and House presented the proposal</p> <p>The board discussed the proposal and the outcome was:</p> <p>10/146/01 Faust was shortlisted</p>
9	<u>Outline evidence Synthesis</u>
9.1	<i>10/138 - The effectiveness and cost effectiveness of laparoscopic versus open rectal resection for cancer (1 proposal)</i>
	<p>Professor Williams chaired</p> <p>Professors Hamdy, Reeves and Morris presented the proposal.</p> <p>The board discussed the proposal and the outcome was:</p> <p>10/138/01 Edlin was shortlisted</p>
	Close of meeting