



CONFIDENTIAL
NIHR HTA Commissioning Board

HTACB/317

Minutes of the Forty-seventh Meeting

Date	Tuesday & Wednesday 27 th and 28 th September 2011
Place	Danubius Hotel, London
Present Members	Professor Hywel Williams (Chair) Professor Jon Deeks (Deputy Chair) Professor Tom Walley Professor Ann Ashburn Professor Peter Croft Professor Jenny Donovan Professor Steven Halligan Professor Allan House Dr Martin Landray Professor Stephen Morris Professor Andrea Nelson Professor John Norrie Dr Rafael Perera Professor Martin Underwood Dr Duncan Young Professor Freddie Hamdy Professor Barney Reeves Professor Marion Walker Professor Jonathan Green Professor Irwin Nazareth
NETSCC, HTA Secretariat	Dr Andrew Cook (Consultant Advisor) Mrs Stephanie Russell (Senior Programme Manager) Mr Mark Townsend (Programme Manager) Miss Daniela Doncakova (Assistant Programme Manager) Mrs Gillian Davage (Administrator)
Apologies	Professor John W Gregory Professor Peter Brocklehurst
Observers	<u>Day 1 only</u> Professor Ruairidh Milne, Director – ERA, NETSCC Ben Patient, IP consultant for the NIHR

	<p>Mark Taylor, IP consultant for the NIHR</p> <p>Ellie Fairbanks, HTA Researcher</p> <p>Kerrie Bayliss, Programme Manager, HTA prioritisation</p>
6.	Primary Research – Full proposals
6.1	<i>09/127/30 - Primary prevention of childhood obesity: evaluation of a group-based antenatal and postnatal care programme for obese pregnant women: the GAPCARE trial feasibility study. (1 proposal)</i>
	<p>Professor Williams chaired.</p> <p>DBMs: Professors Norrie, Nazareth and Reeves presented the proposal. Written comments from Professor Gregory</p> <p>The board discussed one proposal and the outcome was:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Gray (09/127/30) - was rejected
6.2	<i>10/98 - Whole body physiotherapy package for hypermobility (3 proposals)</i>
	<p>Professor Williams chaired.</p> <p>DBMs: Professors Ashburn, Dr Young and Walker presented three proposals.</p> <p>The board discussed three proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Carnes (10/98/03) was rejected • Steultjens (10/98/04) was rejected • Palmer was recommended for funding with changes
6.3	<i>10/99 - Physiotherapy for osteoporotic vertebral fracture (2 proposals)</i>
	<p>Professor Williams chaired.</p> <p>DBMs: Professors Nelson, Ashburn and Halligan presented two proposals</p> <p>The board discussed two proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Barker (10/99/01) was recommended for funding with changes • Underwood (10/99/05) was rejected

6.4	10/101 - Cognitive Behaviour therapy in treatment-resistant schizophrenia (2 proposals)
	<p>Professor Deeks chaired.</p> <p>DBMs: Professors House, Hamdy and Dr Landray presented two proposals. Written comments from Professor Gregory</p> <p>The board discussed two proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Morrison (10/101/02) was recommended for funding with changes • Haddock (10/101/03) was rejected
6.5	10/102 - Supported self-management of diabetes in people with learning disability (1 proposal)
	<p>Professor Deeks chaired.</p> <p>DBMs: Drs Young, Perera and Nazareth presented the proposal.</p> <p>The board discussed one proposal and the outcome was:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • House (10/102/03) was recommended for funding with changes
6.6	10/103 - Use of mood stabilisers in borderline personality disorder (2 proposals)
	<p>Professor Deeks chaired.</p> <p>DBMs: Professors Green and House presented the two proposals. Written comments were provided from Professor Brocklehurst</p> <p>The board discussed two proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Crawford (10/103/01) was recommended for funding with changes • Moran (10/103/03) was rejected
7	Evidence Synthesis Fulls
7.1	10/94 – A clinical decision rule to help decide on cessation of anticoagulant therapy (2 proposals)
	Professor Williams chaired.

	<p>DBMs: Professor Underwood, Dr Young and Professor Reeves presented two proposals.</p> <p>The board discussed two proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Goodacre (10/94/01) was rejected • Fitzmaurice (10/94/02) was recommended for funding with changes
7.2	<i>10/100 - Management of thoracic aortic aneurysm (1 proposal)</i>
	<p>Professor Williams chaired.</p> <p>DBMs: Dr Young, Professor Reeves and Dr Perera presented the proposal.</p> <p>The board discussed one proposal and the outcome was:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Large (10/100/02) was rejected
7.3	<i>11/22 - Tools and outcome measures for monitoring autism spectrum disorder (3 proposals)</i>
	<p>Professor Williams chaired.</p> <p>DBMs: Professors Nazareth, Norrie and Morris presented three proposals.</p> <p>The board discussed three proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Boyle (11/22/01) was rejected • Kendall (11/22/02) was rejected • McConachie (11/22/03) was recommended for funding with changes
7.4	<i>11/27 - Non-invasive ventilation for stable end stage chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (1 proposal)</i>
	<p>Professor Williams chaired.</p> <p>DBMs: Dr Landray, Professors Morris and House presented the proposal</p> <p>The board discussed one proposal and the outcome was:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Moore (11/27/01) was recommended for funding with changes via chair's action.
7.5	<i>11/29 - The relationship between refluxing pelvic veins and pelvic pain.</i>

	(3 proposals)
	<p>Professor Williams chaired.</p> <p>DBMs: Professors Halligan, Hamdy and Nelson presented three proposals.</p> <p>The board discussed three proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Daniels (11/29/01) was recommended for straight funding • McCollum (11/29/02) was rejected • Khan (11/29/03) was rejected
8	Primary Research Outlines
8.1	<i>11/19 - Pre-operative smoking cessation interventions (5 proposals)</i>
	<p>Professor Donovan chaired.</p> <p>DBMs: Professors Reeves, House and Dr Perera presented five proposals.</p> <p>The board discussed five proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 11/19/01 – Strang was rejected • 11/19/02 – Moore was shortlisted • 11/19/03 – Matata was rejected • 11/19/04 – Haw was rejected • 11/19/05 – Britton was rejected
8.2	<i>11/21 - Automated reading of retinal photography in diabetic eye screening (3 proposals)</i>
	<p>Professor Deeks chaired.</p> <p>DBMs: Professors Halligan, Gregory and Norrie presented three proposals.</p> <p>The board discussed three proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 11/21/01 – Nussey was shortlisted • 11/21/02 – Tufail was shortlisted • 11/21/03 – Saleh was shortlisted
8.3	<i>11/23 - The use of ultrasound and magnetic resonance imaging in the assessment of Crohn's disease (1 proposal)</i>

	<p>Professor Deeks Chaired</p> <p>DBMs: Dr Young and Professor Norrie presented the proposal. Professor Gregory provided written comments.</p> <p>The board discussed one proposal and the outcome was:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 11/23/01 – Taylor was shortlisted
8.4	<p><i>11/24 - Treatment-to-target strategies in rheumatoid arthritis (4 proposals)</i></p>
	<p>Professor Williams chaired</p> <p>DBMs: Professor Underwood and Dr Perera presented four proposals. Written comments were provided from Professor Brocklehurst.</p> <p>The board discussed four proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 11/24/01 – Choy was rejected • 11/24/02 – Buch was rejected • 11/24/03 – Kirwan was rejected • 11/24/04 – Kay was shortlisted
8.5	<p><i>11/26 - Robot-assisted training devices for upper limb disability in post-stroke patients (5 proposals)</i></p>
	<p>Professor Williams chaired</p> <p>DBMs: Professors Walker, Underwood and Donovan presented five proposals.</p> <p>The board discussed five proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 11/26/01 – Bhakta was rejected • 11/26/02 – Bhakta was shortlisted • 11/26/03 – Rodgers was shortlisted • 11/26/06 – Dubey was rejected • 11/26/07 – Burrige was shortlisted
8.6	<p><i>11/25 - Surveillance regimes following early breast cancer (1 proposal)</i></p>
	<p>Professor Deeks chaired</p> <p>DBMs:</p>

	<p>Professors Nazareth, Halligan and Dr Landray presented the proposal</p> <p>The board discussed one proposal and the outcome was:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 11/25/01 – Lim was rejected
8.7	<i>11/28 - Mechanical Insufflation-Esufflation devices for assisted cough in neuromuscular disease (1 proposal)</i>
	<p>Professor Deeks chaired</p> <p><i>DBMs</i> Dr Landray and Professors Nazareth and Morris presented the proposal</p> <p>The board discussed one proposal and the outcome was:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 11/28/01 – Simmonds was shortlisted
8.8	<i>11/32 - Pharmacotherapy plus adjunctive support for alcohol dependence (1 proposal)</i>
	<p>Professor Deeks Chaired</p> <p><i>DBMs</i> Professors Donovan and Morris presented the proposal. Written comments provided from Professor Brocklehurst.</p> <p>The board discussed one proposal and the outcome was:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 11/32/01 – Pirmohamed was rejected
8.9	<i>11/35 - The risk and benefits of psychotropic medication during pregnancy (6 proposals)</i>
	<p>Professor Deeks Chaired</p> <p><i>DBMs</i> Professors Nelson, Green and Hamdy presented six proposals</p> <p>The board discussed six proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 11/35/01 – Howard was rejected • 11/35/02 – Jordan was rejected • 11/35/02 – Thangaratinam was rejected • 11/35/04 – Shakir was shortlisted • 11/35/05 – Abel was shortlisted • 11/35/06 – Peterson was shortlisted
8.10	<i>11/33 - Integrated rehabilitation interventions after surgical treatment for hip fracture in older people (6 proposals)</i>

	<p>Professor Williams chaired</p> <p><i>DBMs:</i> Professors Ashburn, Donovan and Underwood presented six proposals.</p> <p>The board discussed six proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 11/33/01 – Cross was shortlisted • 11/33/02 – Rushton was rejected • 11/33/03 – Williams was shortlisted • 11/33/04 – Rangan was rejected • 11/33/05 – McGregor was rejected • 11/33/06 – Sahota was rejected
8.11	11/34 - Guided reduction of antipsychotic medication (1 proposal)
	<p>Professor Williams chaired</p> <p><i>DBMs:</i> Professors Green and Walker presented the proposal. Written comments were provided from Professor Brocklehurst</p> <p>The board discussed one proposal and the outcome was:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 11/34/01 – Singh was shortlisted
9	Close of meeting