



CONFIDENTIAL
NIHR HTA Commissioning Board

Minutes of the Forty-Third Meeting – Day One

Date	Tuesday 28 th and 29 th September 2010
Place	Grange Holborn Hotel, London
Present Members	Professor Hywel Williams (Chair) Professor Andrew Farmer (Deputy Chair) Professor Tom Walley (Programme Director) Professor Ann Ashburn Professor Deborah Ashby Professor Peter Brocklehurst Professor John Cairns Professor Peter Croft Professor Jenny Donovan Professor John Gregory Professor Steven Halligan Professor Allan House Dr Martin Landray Professor Stephen Morris Professor Andrea Nelson Professor John Norrie Dr Rafael Perera Professor Barney Reeves Professor David Torgerson Professor Martin Underwood Dr Duncan Young Professor Marion Walker
NETSCC, HTA Secretariat	Dr Andrew Cook (Consultant Advisor) Dr Bob Coates (Consultant Advisor) Dr Nick Hicks (Consultant Advisor) – Day One Mrs Stephanie Russell (Senior Programme Manager) Miss Vicky Bowness (Programme Manager) Ms Helen Day (Assistant Programme Manager) - Day One Mrs Gillian Davage (Administrator)
Apologies	Professor Freddie Hamdy Professor John Cairns Dr Rafael Perera Professor Ann Ashburn – Day one only.
Observers	Kate Rodger (Programme Manager, NETSCC PHR) – Day two

Primary Research – Full proposals**09/110 - Nicotine replacement therapy pre-loading**

Professor Farmer chaired. Professors Croft, Ashby and House presented the proposal. Professor Donovan, Reeves, Torgerson and Williams left the room.

The board discussed one proposal and the outcome was:

Aveyard (09/110/01) will be invited to resubmit a full proposal

09/118 - Antibiotics in the management of atopic eczema

Professor Farmer chaired. Dr Landray and Professors Croft and Torgerson presented the two proposals. Professors Donovan, Gregory and Reeves left the room.

The board discussed two proposals and the outcome was:

Sheikh (09/118/02) was rejected

Francis (09/118/03) will be recommended for funding

09/115 Duodenal stenting for malignant gastric outlet obstruction

Professor Farmer chaired. Dr Landray and Professor Morris presented the two proposals. Professor Donovan, Halligan, Norrie, Reeves, Underwood, Walley and Williams left the room.

The board discussed two proposals and the outcome was:

Ghaneh (09/115/01) was rejected

Johnson (09/115/02) was rejected

The board were unable to commission in this area and the topic will be returned to Prioritisation.

Evidence Synthesis – Full proposals**10/33 - Diagnosis and treatment of Vitamin D deficiency during pregnancy**

Professor Williams chaired. Professors Brocklehurst, Torgerson and Croft presented the three applications. Professors Farmer and Walley left the room.

The board discussed three proposals and the outcome was:

Meads (10/33/03) was rejected

Harvey (10/33/04) will be recommended for funding

Bishop (10/33/05) was rejected

10/35 - The psychological and mental health assessment of 'young offenders'

Professor Williams chaired. Professors Morris, House and Donovan presented the proposal. Professor Torgerson left the room.

The board discussed two proposals and the outcome was:

McMillan (10/35/01) will be recommended for funding subject to changes being made

Shaw (10/35/02) was rejected

10/45 - Early parenting intervention for families with young children showing severe attachment problems

Professor Williams chaired. Professors Ashby, Gregory and Donovan presented the three proposals. Professors Brocklehurst, Farmer, Nelson, House, Torgerson, Underwood and Dr Landray left the room.

The board discussed three proposals and the outcome was:

Barlow (10/45/01) was rejected

Ramchandani (10/45/03) was rejected

Wright (10/45/04) will be recommended for funding subject to changes being made

10/36 - The diagnostic utility of identifying aspirin resistance

Professor Williams chaired. Drs Landray and Young presented the three proposals. Professors Donovan, Reeves and Torgerson left the room.

The board discussed three proposals and the outcome was:

Burch (10/36/01) was rejected

Fitzmaurice (10/36/02) will be recommended for funding

Mumford (10/36/03) was rejected

10/44 - Supported self management for patients with moderate to severe chronic obstructive pulmonary disease

Professor Williams chaired. Professors Torgerson, Reeves and Nelson presented the three proposals. Professors Norrie and Underwood left the room.

The board discussed three proposals and the outcome was:

Jordan (10/44/01) will be recommended for funding

Rees (10/44/03) was rejected

Taylor (10/44/05) was rejected

Direct Research Projects (DRPs)**10/47 - The cost effectiveness of fetal fibronectin testing in suspected premature labour**

Professor Williams chaired. Professor Nelson, Brocklehurst and Dr Landray presented the proposal. Professor Norrie left the room.

The board discussed one proposal and the outcome was:

Stock (10/47/01) was rejected

The board were unable to commission in this area and the topic will be returned to Prioritisation.

10/82/01 - A Study of Donor Ex-vivo Lung Perfusion in UK Lung Transplantation (DEVELOP-UK)

Professor Williams chaired. Dr Young and Professors Reeves and Halligan presented the proposal. Professor Ashby left the room

The board discussed one proposal and the outcome was:

Fisher (10/82/01) was shortlisted

HTA Commissioning Board

Minutes of the Forty-Third Meeting – Day Two

Primary Research – Outline Proposals**10/31 - Effectiveness of financial or other incentives**

Professor Farmer chaired. Professor Nelson, Donovan and House presented the six proposals. Professors Brocklehurst, Farmer, Norrie, Torgerson, Underwood and Dr Landray left the room.

The board discussed six proposals and the outcome was:

Denison (10/31/01) was shortlisted

Hoddinott (10/31/02) was shortlisted

Bennett (10/31/03) was rejected

Marteau (10/31/04) was rejected

Adamson (10/31/05) was shortlisted

Konje (10/31/06) was rejected

10/32 - Comparison of pedometer-based walking interventions

Professor Walley chaired. Professor Walker, Morris and Croft presented the twelve proposals. Professor Brocklehurst, Donovan, Farmer, House, Reeves, Underwood, Williams and Dr Perera left the room.

The board discussed twelve proposals and the outcome was:

McMurdo (10/32/01) was rejected

Harris (10/32/02) was shortlisted

Mutrie (10/32/03) was rejected

Lowry (10/32/04) was rejected

Mead (10/32/05) was rejected

Simpson (10/32/06) was rejected

Kendrick (10/32/07) was rejected

French (10/32/08) was shortlisted

Hillsdon (10/32/09) was rejected

Lawton (10/32/10) was rejected

Davies (10/32/11) was rejected

Sutton (10/32/12) was rejected

10/37 - Rehabilitation more than six months after a stroke

Professor Walley chaired. Professors Reeves, Halligan and Ashby presented the four proposals. Professors Ashburn, Farmer, House, Underwood, Walker and Williams left the room.

The board discussed four proposals and the outcome was:

Rodgers (10/37/01) was shortlisted

Dean (10/37/02) was rejected

Underwood (10/37/03) was shortlisted

Sackley (10/37/04) was shortlisted

10/34 - The clinical and cost effectiveness of personalised care in the treatment of women with breast cancer

Professor Williams chaired. Professors Brocklehurst, Torgerson and Norrie presented the two proposals. Professor Donovan, Morris, Gregory, Reeves left the room.

The board discussed two proposals and the outcome was:

Stein (10/34/01) was shortlisted

Mansel (10/34/02) was rejected

10/38 - Scoliosis-specific exercises in adolescent idiopathic scoliosis

Professor Williams chaired. Professor Ashburn, Nelson and Walker presented the three proposals. Professor Donovan, Reeves, Underwood and Young left the room.

The board discussed three proposals and the outcome was:

Clark (10/38/01) was rejected

Chockalingam (10/38/02) was shortlisted

Lamb (10/38/03) was shortlisted

10/39 - Complex decongestive therapy for women with breast-cancer related lymphoedema of the arm

Professor Farmer chaired. Professors Morris, Nelson and Norrie presented the proposal. Professors Walker and Williams left the room.

The board discussed one proposal and the outcome was:

Keeley (10/39/01) was shortlisted

10/40 - Operative interventions for acute scaphoid fractures

Professor Farmer chaired. Professors Norrie, Ashburn and Donovan presented the three proposals. Professor Torgerson, Underwood, Walker, Walley and Williams left the room.

The board discussed three proposals and the outcome was:

Hodgson (10/40/01) was rejected

Heras-Palou (10/40/02) was rejected

Dias (10/40/03) was rejected

The board were unable to commission in this area and the topic will be returned to prioritisation.

10/42 - Long term outcomes from bariatric surgery

Professor Farmer Chaired. Professor Halligan and Drs Young and Landray presented the ten proposals. Professors Ashburn, Ashby, Donovan, House, Norrie, Reeves, Underwood, Walker and Williams left the room.

The board discussed ten proposals and the outcome was:

Ogden (10/42/01) was rejected

Logue (10/42/02) was shortlisted

Douglas (10/42/03) was shortlisted

McGowan (10/42/04) was rejected

Pinkney (10/42/05) was rejected

Taheri (10/42/06) was shortlisted

Roderick (10/42/07) was rejected

Le Roux (10/42/08) was rejected

Relton (10/42/09) was shortlisted

Kalli (10/42/10) was rejected

10/41 - Therapeutic hip arthroscopy

Professor Williams Chaired. Professors Reeves, Nelson and Brocklehurst presented the five proposals. Professors Farmer and Underwood left the room.

The board discussed five proposals and the outcome was:

Glyn-Jones (10/41/01) was shortlisted

Griffin (10/41/02) was shortlisted

Field (10/41/03) was rejected

McCaskie (10/41/04) was shortlisted

Board (10/41/05) was rejected

10/46 - Sustained-release naltrexone for opioid dependence

Professor Williams chaired. Professors Croft, Brocklehurst and House presented the proposal.

The board discussed one proposal and the outcome was:

Strang (10/46/01) was shortlisted

10/43 - Sensory, psychological and behavioural interventions for agitation in dementia.

Professor Williams chaired. Professors Norrie, Ashburn and Halligan presented the three proposals. Professors House, Morris and Underwood left the room.

The board discussed three proposals and the outcome was:

Livingston (10/43/01) will be recommended for funding subject to changes being made

Hulme (10/44/03) was rejected

Bridle (10/43/03) was rejected

Close of meeting