

CONFIDENTIAL
NIHR HTA Commissioning Board

Minutes of the Thirty Ninth Meeting - Day One

Date	Wednesday 30 th September and Thursday 1 st October 2009
Place	Danubius Hotel, London
Present Members	Professor Jon Nicholl (Chair) Dr Andrew Farmer (Deputy Chair) Professor Ann Ashburn Professor Deborah Ashby (Day 1 only) Professor John Cairns Professor Peter Croft Professor Jenny Donovan Professor Steven Halligan Professor Freddie Hamdy Professor Allan House Dr Martin Landray (Day 1 only) Professor Stuart Logan Professor Stephen Morris Dr Rafael Perera (Day 1 only) Professor David Torgerson Professor Mark Sculpher Professor Tom Walley (Programme Director) Professor Hywel Williams (Day 2 only)
NETSCC, HTA Secretariat	Dr Peter Davidson (Director of Science Support & Consultant Advisor) Dr Sarah Thomas (Senior Programme Manager) Miss Vicky Bowness (Programme Manager) Ms Helen Day (Assistant Programme Manager) Mrs Carly Ballan (Administrator) Dr Bob Coates (Consultant Adviser) – Day 1 only Dr Andrew Cook (Consultant Adviser) – Day 1 only Dr Simon Fraser (Consultant Adviser) – Day 2 only
Apologies	Professor Helen Smith Dr Rafael Perera – Day 2 only Dr Martin Landray – Day 2 only Professor Deborah Ashby – Day 2 only Professor Hywel Williams – Day 1 only Dr Morven Roberts (MRC observer) Dr Nick Hicks (Consultant Adviser)
Observers (Day 1)	Mr Kevin Campbell (Programme Manager NETSCC)
Observers (Day 2)	None

Primary Research - Full Proposals

08/20 – An intervention to reduce teenage pregnancy in young women who are ‘looked after’

Professor Nicholl chaired. Professors Croft, Ashby and Donovan presented the proposal. Professor Cairns left the room.

The board discussed one proposal and the outcome was:

Mezey (08/20/03) will be invited to resubmit a full proposal.

08/104 - Pit and fissure sealants versus fluoride to prevent dental decay in children

Professor Nicholl chaired. Dr Perera and Professors Croft and Torgerson presented the two proposals. Professor House left the room.

The board discussed two proposals and the outcome was:

Toumba (08/104/02) was rejected.

Chestnutt (08/104/04) was recommended for funding.

08/106 - Interferon gamma test for identification of active TB

Professor Nicholl chaired. Professors Hamdy, Halligan and Cairns presented the two proposals. Professors Ashby, Sculpher and Torgerson left the room.

The board discussed two proposals and the outcome was:

Zumla (08/106/01) was rejected.

Lalvani (08/106/02) will be recommended for funding subject to changes being made.

08/109 - Angiotensin-converting enzyme inhibitors for abdominal aortic aneurysm

Professor Nicholl chaired. Dr Landray and Professor Hamdy and House presented the two proposals. Professors Ashby, Sculpher and Torgerson left the room.

The board discussed two proposals and the outcome was:

Poulter (08/109/02) was recommended for funding.

Chetter (08/109/06) was rejected.

08/113 - Helping young women on hormonal contraception to stop smoking

Professor Nicholl chaired. Professor Ashby and Dr Perera presented the proposals. Professors Sculpher and Torgerson left the room.

The board discussed one proposal and the outcome was:

Watts (08/113/01) was rejected.

The Board was unable to commission in this area and the topic will be returned to Prioritisation.

08/107 - Insulin pump therapy for patients with type 1 diabetes

Doctor Farmer chaired. Professor Torgerson, Dr Landray and Professor Ashby presented the proposal. Professors Nicholl and Logan left the room

The board discussed one proposal and the outcome was:

Heller (08/107/01) will be recommended for funding subject to changes being made.

08/110 - Oral appliances in the treatment of obstructive sleep apnoea-hypopnoea

Dr Farmer chaired. Professors Ashburn, Dr Landray and Professor Sculpher presented the three proposals. Professors Donovan, Hamdy and Nicholl left the room.

The board discussed three proposals and the outcome was:

Quinnell (08/110/03) was recommended for funding.

Martin (08/110/04) was rejected.

Banerjee (08/110/07) was rejected.

Evidence Synthesis - Full Proposals

09/27 - Reducing obesity in pregnant women

Dr Farmer chaired. Professors Croft, Cairns and Donovan presented the proposal. Professors Nicholl, Sculpher and Torgerson left the room.

The board discussed three proposals and the outcome was:

McGuire (09/27/03) was rejected.

Khan (09/27/06) was recommended for funding.

Campbell (09/27/11) was rejected.

HTA Commissioning Board

Minutes of the Thirty Ninth Meeting – Day Two

09/28 - What is the clinical effectiveness of folic acid supplementation in stroke prevention.

This topic was withdrawn prior to the board meeting.

09/29 - The added value of PET/CT for restaging in recurrent cervical cancer.

Professor Nicholl chaired. Professor Halligan and Dr Farmer presented the two proposals.

The board discussed two proposals and the outcome was:

Fenwick (09/29/01) was rejected.

Khan (09/29/02) will be recommended for funding.

09/30 - The psychological consequences of false positive Mammograms

Professor Nicholl chaired. Professor Williams and Croft presented the three proposals. Professors Morris and House left the room.

The board discussed three proposals and the outcome was:

Knussen (09/30/01) was rejected.

Weller 09/30/02 was rejected.

Vaidya (09/30/03) was rejected.

The Board was unable to commission in this area and the topic will be returned to Prioritisation.

Primary Research – Outline Proposals

09/31 - What methods of speech and language therapy best improve the speech intelligibility and effectiveness of communication in people with Parkinson's disease.

Dr Farmer chaired. Professor House, Donovan and Cairns presented the five proposals. Professor Ashburn, Morris and Nicholl left the room.

The board discussed five proposals and the outcome was:

Miller (09/31/01) was shortlisted.

Sackley (09/31/02) was shortlisted.

Enderby (09/31/03) was rejected.

Gage (09/31/04) was rejected.

Limousin (09/31/05) was rejected.

09/35 - Long term outcomes from bariatric surgery

Dr Farmer chaired. Professors Halligan and Hamdy presented the seven proposals. Professor Ashburn, Morris and Nicholl left the room.

The board discussed seven proposals and the outcome was:

Stephens (09/35/01) was rejected.

Metwally (09/35/02) was rejected.

Finer (09/35/03) was rejected.

Roderick (09/35/04) was rejected.

Tan (09/35/05) was rejected.

Le Roux (09/35/06) was rejected.

Taheri (09/35/07) was rejected.

The Board was unable to commission in this area and the topic will be returned to Prioritisation.

09/37 - Interventions to increase physical activity in healthcare professionals
Dr Farmer chaired. Professors Ashburn, Logan and Doctor Perera presented the five proposals. Professors Cairns, Nicholl, Sculpher and Torgerson left the room.

The board discussed five proposals and the outcome was:

Woodcock (09/37/01) was shortlisted.
McKenna (09/37/02) was shortlisted.
Sewell (09/37/03) was rejected.
Haddad (09/37/04) was rejected.
Morrell (09/37/05) was rejected.

09/33 - Psychological therapies for depression among patients with advanced cancer (no longer amenable to curative treatment)

Professor Nicholl chaired. Professors Williams, House and Croft presented the three proposals. Dr Farmer left the room.

The board discussed three proposals and the outcome was:

Stuart (09/33/01) was shortlisted.
Serfaty (09/33/02) was shortlisted.
Bridle (09/33/03) was shortlisted.

09/34 - Multi-compartment medication devices

Professor Nicholl chaired. Professor Williams and Dr Farmer presented the four proposals. Professor House left the room.

The board discussed four proposals and the outcome was:

Brittain (09/34/01) was rejected.
Raynor (09/34/02) was rejected.
Bhattacharya (09/34/03) was shortlisted.
McKisnry (09/34/04) was rejected.

09/36 - Self-management education for adults with poorly controlled epilepsy

Professor Nicholl chaired. Professors Sculpher, Williams and Logan presented the proposal. Professor Walley left the room.

The board discussed one proposal and the outcome was:

Ridsdale (09/36/01) was rejected.

The Board was unable to commission in this area and the topic will be returned to Prioritisation.

Evidence Synthesis – Full Proposal (DRP)

09/103 - Devising guidelines for the clinical management for contacts of people with infectious multi-drug resistant tuberculosis

Professor Nicholl Chaired. Professors Halligan and Donovan presented the proposal. Professor Walley left the room.

The board discussed one proposal and the outcome was:

Abba (09/103/01) will be recommended for funding subject to changes being made.

Close of meeting