



CONFIDENTIAL

HTACB/300

NIHR HTA Commissioning Board

Minutes of the Forty-fifth Meeting

Date	Tuesday & Wednesday 29th/ 30 th March 2011
Place	Danubius Hotel, London
Present Members	Professor Hywel Williams (Chair) Professor Andrew Farmer (Deputy Chair) Professor Jon Deeks (Deputy Chair Designate) (Day 1 only) Professor Tom Walley (Programme Director) Professor Ann Ashburn Professor Jenny Donovan Professor Jonathan Green (Day 2 only) Professor John Gregory Professor Stephen Halligan Professor Freddie Hamdy Professor Allan House Dr Martin Landray (Day 1 only) Professor Stephen Morris (Day 2 only, by teleconference) Professor Andrea Nelson Professor John Norrie Dr Rafael Perera Professor Barney Reeves (Day 2 only, by teleconference) Professor Martin Underwood
NETSCC, HTA Secretariat	Dr Andrew Cook (Consultant Advisor) Dr Nick Hicks (Consultant Advisor) (Day 2 only) Mrs Stephanie Russell (Senior Programme Manager) Mr Mark Townsend (Programme Manager) Miss Daniela Doncakova (Assistant Programme Manager) Mrs Gillian Davage (Administrator)
Apologies	Professor Peter Brocklehurst Professor Marion Walker Dr Duncan Young
Observers	Glenn Wells - Deputy Director, Head of Research Finance and Programmes, Department of Health – (Day 1 PM only) Kay Pattison - Senior NIHR Programme Manager, Research and Development Directorate, Department of Health – (Day 2 only) Luke Jarvis - Strategic Commercial Advisor, Procurement, Investment and Commercial Division, Department of Health – (Day 2 only) Elke Streit – Researcher, Diagnostic Technologies and Screening Panel, NETSCC, HTA - (Day 2 only)

	Sarah Puddicombe – Assistant Director, NETSCC, HTA - (Day 2 only).
6.	<u>Primary Research – Full proposals</u>
6.1	<i>09/110 - Nicotine replacement therapy pre-loading (1 proposal)</i>
	<p>Professor Farmer chaired.</p> <p>Professors House and Norrie and Dr Landray presented the proposal.</p> <p>The board discussed one proposal and the outcome was:</p> <p>Aveyard (09/110/01) was recommended for funding</p>
6.2	<i>09/127/19 - Positive Online Weight Reduction (POWER) (1 proposal)</i>
	<p>Professor Walley chaired.</p> <p>Professors Underwood, Gregory and Morris presented the proposal.</p> <p>The board discussed one proposal and the outcome was:</p> <p>Little (09/127/19) was recommended for funding</p>
6.3	<i>10/31 - Effectiveness of financial or other incentives (2 proposals)</i>
	<p>Professor Williams chaired.</p> <p>Professors Nelson, Donovan and House presented the proposal.</p> <p>The board discussed two proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <p>Denison (10/31/01) was rejected. Hoddinott (10/31/02) was recommended for funding with changes</p>
6.4	<i>10/32 - Comparison of pedometer-based walking interventions (2 proposals)</i>
	<p>Professor Williams chaired.</p> <p>Professors Cairns and Ashburn presented two proposals. Professor Reeves' comments were read out by the Chair.</p> <p>The board discussed two proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <p>Harris (10/32/02) was recommended for fund with changes. French (10/32/08) was rejected.</p>
6.5	<i>10/34 – The clinical and cost effectiveness of personalised care in the treatment of women with breast cancer (1 proposal)</i>
	Professor Farmer chaired.

	<p>Professors Norrie, Morris and Brocklehurst (absent) presented the proposal.</p> <p>The board discussed one proposal and the outcome was:</p> <p>Stein (10/34/01) was recommended for fund with changes.</p>
6.6	<i>10/37 – Rehabilitation more than six months after a stroke (2 proposals)</i>
	<p>Professor Deeks chaired.</p> <p>Professor Halligan presented the two proposals.</p> <p>Professors Green and Reeves' comments were read out by the chair</p> <p>The board discussed two proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <p>Rodgers (10/37/01) was approved for straight funding. Underwood (10/37/03) was rejected.</p>
6.7	<i>10/39 – Complex decongestive therapy for women with breast-cancer related lymphoedema of the arm (1 proposal)</i>
	<p>Professor Deeks chaired.</p> <p>Professors Morris and Norrie presented the proposal. Dr Young's comments were read out by the chair.</p> <p>The board discussed one proposal and the outcome was:</p> <p>Keeley (10/39/01) was rejected.</p>
6.8	<i>10/46 – Sustained-release naltrexone for opioid dependence (1 proposal)</i>
	<p>Professor Williams chaired.</p> <p>Dr Perera and Professors House and Underwood presented the proposal.</p> <p>The board discussed one proposal and the outcome was:</p> <p>Strang (10/46/01) was recommended for fund with changes.</p>
6.9	<i>10/41 – Therapeutic hip arthroscopy (3 proposals)</i>
	<p>Professor Deeks chaired.</p> <p>Professors Cairns and Ashburn presented the proposals and Dr Young's comments were read out by the chair.</p> <p>The board discussed three proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <p>Glyn-Jones was rejected. Griffin was recommended for fund with changes. McCaskie was rejected.</p>

6.10	<i>10/42 – Long term outcomes from bariatric surgery (4 proposals)</i>
	<p>Professor Walley chaired.</p> <p>Dr Landray and Professors Hamdy and Halligan presented the four proposals</p> <p>The board discussed four proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <p>Logue (10/42/02) was recommended for funding with changes Taheri (10/42/06) was rejected. Douglas(10/42/03) was rejected. Relton (10/42/09) was rejected.</p>
6.11	<i>10/38 - Scoliosis-specific exercises in adolescent idiopathic scoliosis (2 proposals)</i>
	<p>Professor Williams chaired.</p> <p>Professors Ashburn, Nelson and Gregory presented the two proposals.</p> <p>The board discussed two proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <p>Chockalingham (10/38/02) was rejected. Lamb (10/38/03) was recommended for funding with changes.</p>
6.12	<i>09/71 Family based interventions for young people who misuse alcohol and/or other substances (1 proposal)</i>
	<p>Professor Williams chaired.</p> <p>Professors Green, Donovan and Dr Perera introduced one proposal.</p> <p>The board discussed one proposal and the outcome was:</p> <p>Eisler (09/71/01) was rejected.</p>
7	Evidence synthesis – full proposals
7.1	<i>10/96 The cost effectiveness of genetic markers for antibiotic resistance in tuberculosis (1 proposal)</i>
	<p>Professor Williams chaired.</p> <p>Professors Green, Norrie and Gregory presented the proposal.</p> <p>The board discussed one proposal and the outcome was:</p> <p>Drobniewski (10/96/01) was recommended for funding</p>
7.2	<i>10/97 The optimum measures and frequency for monitoring lipid levels (2 proposals)</i>

	<p>Professor Williams chaired.</p> <p>Professors Halligan, Cairns and Donovan presented the two proposals</p> <p>The board discussed two proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <p>Perera (10/97/01) was recommended for funding Jones (10/97/02) was rejected</p>
7.3	<i>09/114 Non-invasive methods for the assessment and monitoring of liver fibrosis and cirrhosis (3 proposals)</i>
	<p>Professor Farmer chaired.</p> <p>Professors Hamdy, Gregory and Nelson presented three proposals.</p> <p>The board discussed two proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <p>Newsome (09/114/01) was rejected Burroughs (09/114/02) was recommended for funding</p>
8	Primary research outlines
8.1	<i>10/95 The whispered voice test for triage of hearing impairment (4 proposals)</i>
	<p>Professor Williams chaired.</p> <p>Professors Donovan, Underwood and Reeves presented four proposals.</p> <p>The board discussed four proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <p>10/95/01 Thyer was rejected 10/95/02 Swan was rejected 10/95/03 Van den Bruel was rejected 10/95/04 Williamson was rejected</p>
8.2	<i>10/98 Whole body physiotherapy package for hypermobility (5 proposals)</i>
	<p>Professor Williams chaired.</p> <p>Professor Norrie, Dr Landray and Professor Ashburn presented five proposals.</p> <p>The board discussed five proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <p>10/98/01 Alexander was rejected 10/98/02 Wolman was rejected 10/98/03 Carnes was shortlisted 10/98/04 Steultjens was shortlisted 10/98/05 Palmer was shortlisted</p>

8.3	<i>10/99 Physiotherapy for osteoporotic vertebral fracture (5 proposals)</i>
	<p>Professor Walley chaired</p> <p>Professors Nelson, Ashburn and Halligan presented the proposals</p> <p>The board discussed five proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <p>10/99/01 Barker was shortlisted 10/99/02 Clark was rejected 10/99/03 Sahota was rejected 10/99/04 Sackley was rejected 10/99/05 Underwood was shortlisted</p>
8.4	<i>10/101 Cognitive Behaviour therapy in treatment-resistant schizophrenia (3 proposals)</i>
	<p>Professor Williams chaired</p> <p>Professors House, Gregory and Hamdy presented three proposals</p> <p>The board discussed three proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <p>10/101/01 Garety was rejected 10/101/02 Morrison was shortlisted 10/101/03 Haddock was shortlisted</p>
8.5	<i>10/102 Supported self management of diabetes in people with learning disability (3 proposals)</i>
	<p>Professor Farmer chaired</p> <p>Professor Cairns and Drs Perera and Landray (absent) presented the proposals.</p> <p>The board discussed three proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <p>10/102/01 Mitchell was rejected 10/102/02 Stenfert-Kroese was rejected 10/102/03 House was shortlisted</p>
8.6	<i>10/103 Use of mood stabilisers in borderline personality disorder (2 proposals)</i>
	<p>Professor Farmer chaired</p> <p>Professors Green, Brocklehurst and House presented two proposals</p> <p>The board discussed two proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <p>10/103/01 Crawford was shortlisted</p>

	10/103/02 Moran was shortlisted
9	Outline evidence Synthesis
9.1	<i>10/100 Management of thoracic aortic aneurysm (4 proposals)</i>
	<p>Professor Farmer chaired</p> <p>Professor Donovan and Dr Perera presented the proposals.</p> <p>The board discussed four proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <p>10/100/01 Thompson was rejected 10/100/02 Large was shortlisted 10/100/03 Thomas was rejected 10/100/04 Field was rejected</p>
9.2	<i>10/94 A clinical decision rule to help decide on cessation of anticoagulant therapy (3 proposals)</i>
	<p>Professor Williams chaired</p> <p>Professor Underwood and Professor Cairns presented three proposals.</p> <p>The board discussed three proposals and the outcomes were:</p> <p>10/94/01 Goodacre was shortlisted 10/94/02 Fitzmaurice was shortlisted 10/94/03 Wu was rejected</p>